



Board of Management Audit Committee

Date of Meeting	Monday 28 November 2016
Paper No.	AC2-E
Agenda Item	8
Subject of Paper	Internal Audit Annual Report 2015-16
FOISA Status	Disclosable
Primary Contact	BDO
Date of production	September 2016
Action	For Discussion

Recommendations

The Committee is asked to consider the report and in particular the Auditors Annual Statement of Assurance.

1. Purpose of report

The purpose of this report is to provide the Committee with a summary of all the internal audit work carried out on behalf of the College during 2015-16.

2. Context and Discussion

BDO have reviewed the control policies and procedures employed by City of Glasgow College to manage risks in business areas identified by management set out in the 2015-16 Annual Internal Audit Plan approved by the Audit Committee. This report is made solely in relation to those business areas and risks reviewed in the year and does not relate to any of the other operations of the organisation.

The Committee has reviewed each of the audit reports noted within the annual report. However, the Committee should give particular attention to the Auditors Annual Statement of Assurance (page 9 of the report).

Conclusion

In our view, based on the reviews undertaken during the period, and in the context of materiality:

- The risk management activities and controls in the areas which we examined were found to be suitably designed to achieve the specific risk management, control and governance arrangements.
- Based on our verification reviews and sample testing, risk management, control and governance arrangements were operating with sufficient effectiveness to provide reasonable, but not absolute assurance that the related risk management, control and governance objectives were achieved for the period under review.

3. Impact and implications

Refer to internal audit report.

CITY OF GLASGOW COLLEGE

INTERNAL AUDIT ANNUAL REPORT 2015-16

September 2016



CONTENTS

Executive Summary	3
Review of 2015-16 work	7
Annual statement of assurance	9
Performance against operational plan	10
Audit performance	11
Appendices:	
I Definitions	12

Restrictions of use

The matters raised in this report are only those which came to our attention during the course of our audit and are not necessarily a comprehensive statement of all the weaknesses that exist or all improvements that might be made. The report has been prepared solely for the management of the organisation and should not be quoted in whole or in part without our prior written consent. BDO LLP neither owes nor accepts any duty to any third party whether in contract or in tort and shall not be liable, in respect of any loss, damage or expense which is caused by their reliance on this report.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Background

Our role as internal auditors is to provide an independent, objective assurance and consulting activity designed to add value and improve an organisation's operations. Our approach, as set out in BDO's Internal Audit Manual, is to help the organisation accomplish its objectives by bringing a systematic, disciplined approach to evaluate and improve the effectiveness of risk management, control and governance processes.

Responsibilities

BDO LLP has been appointed as internal auditors to City of Glasgow College to provide the Board (via the Audit Committee), the Chief Executive and other managers with assurance on the adequacy of the following arrangements:

- Risk Management;
- Corporate Governance; and
- Internal Control.

Responsibility for these arrangements remains fully with management, who should recognise that internal audit can only provide 'reasonable assurance' and cannot provide any guarantee against material errors, loss or fraud. Our role at City of Glasgow College is also aimed at helping management to improve risk management, governance and internal control, so reducing the effects of any significant risks facing the organisation.

Our risk evaluations and tests are designed to ensure that controls are sound both in design and effective in operation. Our conclusions are based on evidence obtained during the course of our audit work, verification tests and samples selected from the year's transactions to date. However, our conclusions should not be taken to mean that all transactions have been properly authorised and processed or that all elements of systems have been tested.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Audit Approach

We have reviewed the control policies and procedures employed by City of Glasgow College to manage risks in business areas identified by management set out in the 2015-16 Annual Internal Audit Plan approved by the Audit Committee. This report is made solely in relation to those business areas and risks reviewed in the year and does not relate to any of the other operations of the organisation.

Our approach complies with best professional practice, in particular, Public Sector Internal Audit Standards and the Chartered Institute of Internal Auditors' Position Statement on Risk Based Internal Auditing.

We discharge our role, as detailed within the audit planning documents agreed with City of Glasgow College management for each review, by:

- Considering the risks that have been identified by management as being associated with the processes under review
- Reviewing the written policies and procedures and holding discussions with management to identify process controls
- Evaluating the risk management activities and controls established by management to address the risks it is seeking to manage
- Performing walkthrough tests to determine whether the expected risk management activities and controls are in place
- Performing compliance tests (where appropriate) to determine whether the risk management activities and controls are operating as expected.

The assurance statement provided on page 8 of this report is based on historical information and the projection of any information or conclusions contained in our opinion to any future periods is subject to the risk that changes may alter its validity.

Coverage

During 2015-16 BDO LLP has reviewed and evaluated City of Glasgow College's processes in the following areas:

- | | |
|---|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Health and Safety Governance• Student Representation• Internal Communications• SUMs• Green Travel• New Campus Project - Post Migration• Libraries and Learning Technologies | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Overall Financial Controls• Admissions and Enrolments• Student Fees• Academic Growth Planning• Treasury Management• International and Commercial Activity• Follow up review |
|---|---|

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Recommendations

To assist management in addressing our findings, we categorise our recommendations according to their level or priority. The recommendations made in the thirteen completed reviews totalled 32.

Summary of Recommendations (SEE APPENDIX I)



Total number of recommendations: 32

Reporting mechanisms and practices

Our initial draft reports are sent to the key officer responsible for the area under review in order to gather management responses. In every instance there is an opportunity to discuss the draft report in detail. Therefore, any issues or concerns can be discussed with management before finalisation of the reports.

Our method of operating with the Audit Committee is to agree reports with management and then present and discuss the matters arising at the Audit Committee meetings.

Management action on our recommendations

Management have been conscientious in review and commenting on our reports. For the reports which have been finalised, management have responded positively. The responses indicate that appropriate steps to implement our recommendations are being put in place.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Relationship with external audit

All our final reports are available to the external auditors through the Audit Committee papers and are available on request. Our files are also available to External Audit should they wish to review working papers in order to place reliance on the work of Internal Audit.

Follow up

During the year we undertook independent exercises to assess the progress made by City of Glasgow College in implementing internal audit recommendations made in previous years, and in the current year where applicable.

Implementation of recommendations is a key determinant of our annual opinion. If recommendations are not implemented on a timely basis then weaknesses in control and governance frameworks will remain in place. Furthermore, an unwillingness or inability to implement recommendations reflects poorly on management's commitment to the maintenance of a robust control environment. Within City of Glasgow College we found an excellent level of commitment and effort in clearing as many outstanding recommendations as possible from previous audit reports.

We followed up 43 recommendations from 2014-15 and where relevant, 2015-16, along with those recommendations which were not categorised as fully implemented at the time of the College's last follow up audit. We note that 28 of these recommendations had been fully implemented, 10 had been partially implemented, with the remaining 5 recommendations not yet implemented.




On that basis we can take substantial assurance that management's resolve to implement previously agreed recommendations is sound.

Summary of work performed




Details of the five internal audit reviews and the follow up review have been reported to the Audit Committee throughout the year and have been discussed at length with consideration and scrutiny of management responses and timescales proposed.

For the purpose of this annual report, we set out in the following pages our summary of recommendations and assessment of the design and effectiveness of the risk assurance for each of the audit areas reviewed.

REVIEW OF 2015-16 WORK

Reports Issued	Overall Report Conclusions - see appendix I				
				Design	Operational Effectiveness
Health and safety governance	0	2	3	Moderate	Moderate
Student representation	0	0	2	Substantial	Substantial
SUMS audit	0	1	0	n/a	n/a
Internal communications	0	5	0	Moderate	Moderate
Green travel	0	3	0	Moderate	Moderate
New campus project - post migration	0	0	1	Substantial	Substantial
Libraries and learning technologies	0	4	1	Moderate	Moderate
Overall financial controls	0	0	2	Substantial	Substantial
Admissions and enrolments	0	0	2	Substantial	Substantial
Student fees	0	0	3	Substantial	Substantial
Academic growth planning	0	0	0	Substantial	Substantial
Treasury management	0	0	2	Substantial	Substantial

REVIEW OF 2015-16 WORK

Reports Issued	Overall Report Conclusions - see appendix I				
				Design	Operational Effectiveness
International and commercial activity	0	0	1	Substantial	Substantial
Follow up	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

ANNUAL STATEMENT OF ASSURANCE

Report by BDO LLP to City of Glasgow College

As the internal auditors of City of Glasgow College we are required to provide the Board, via the Audit Committee, and other management with a view on the adequacy and effectiveness of City of Glasgow College's risk management, governance and internal control processes.

In giving our view it should be noted that assurance can never be absolute. The internal audit service provides City of Glasgow College with reasonable assurance that, there are no major weaknesses in the internal control system for the areas reviewed in 2015-16. Therefore, the statement of assurance is not a guarantee that all other aspects of the internal control system are adequate and effective. The statement of assurance should confirm that, based on the evidence of the audits conducted, there are no other signs of material weakness in the framework of control.

In assessing the level of assurance to be given, we have taken into account:

- All internal audits undertaken by BDO LLP during 2015-16;
- Any follow-up action taken in respect of audits from previous periods for these audit areas;
- Whether any significant recommendations have not been accepted by management and the consequent risks;
- The effects of any significant changes in the organisation's objectives or systems;
- The requirements of the Public Sector Internal Audit Standards; and
- Any limitations which may have been placed on the scope of internal audit (no restrictions were placed on our work).

Conclusion

In our view, based on the reviews undertaken during the period, and in the context of materiality:

- The risk management activities and controls in the areas which we examined were found to be suitably designed to achieve the specific risk management, control and governance arrangements.
- Based on our verification reviews and sample testing, risk management, control and governance arrangements were operating with sufficient effectiveness to provide reasonable, but not absolute assurance that the related risk management, control and governance objectives were achieved for the period under review.

PERFORMANCE AGAINST OPERATIONAL PLAN

Visit	Date of visit	Proposed Audit	Planned Days	Actual Days	Status
1	May 2015	Health and safety governance	5	5	Complete
2	June 2015	Student representation	5	5	Complete
3	September 2015	Internal communications	5	5	Complete
4	September 2015	SUMs	8	8	Complete
5	November 2015	Green travel	5	5	Complete
6	December 2015	New campus project - post migration	5	5	Complete
7	January 2016	Libraries and learning technologies	5	5	Complete
8	February 2016	Overall financial controls	5	5	Complete
9	February 2016	Admissions and enrolments	5	5	Complete
10	March 2016	Student fees	5	5	Complete
11	April 2016	Academic growth planning	5	5	Complete
12	May 2016	Treasury Management	5	5	Complete
13	May 2016	International and commercial activity	5	5	Complete
14	July 2016	Follow up	4	4	Complete
	TOTAL		72		





AUDIT PERFORMANCE




AUDIT	COMPLETION OF FIELDWORK	DRAFT REPORT	FINAL MANAGEMENT RESPONSES	FINAL REPORT
Health and safety governance	15 May 2015	21 May 2015	10 June 2015	10 June 2015
Student representation	12 June 2015	2 July 2015	30 July 2015	30 July 2015
Internal communications	20 October 2015	23 October 2015	20 November 2015	20 November 2015
SUMs	8 October 2015	9 October 2015	9 October 2015	9 October 2015
Green travel	12 November 2015	27 November 2015	17 December 2015	17 December 2015
New campus project - post migration	18 December 2015	15 January 2016	15 February 2016	17 February 2016
Libraries and learning technologies	12 February 2016	24 February 2016	30 March 2016	31 March 2016
Overall financial controls	12 February 2016	29 February 2016	7 April 2016	7 April 2016
Admissions and enrolments	15 March 2016	31 March 2016	27 April 2016	27 April 2016
Student fees	18 March 2016	1 April 2016	3 May 2016	3 May 2016
Academic growth planning	28 April 2016	9 May 2016	17 June 2016	20 June 2016
Treasury management	3 June 2016	21 June 2016	28 June 2016	28 June 2016
International and commercial activity	20 June 2016	24 June 2016	28 July 2016	3 August 2016
Follow up	26 August 2016	2 September 2016	n/a	n/a


On average:

- All reports were issued in draft within 10 working days of completion of our fieldwork and a debrief meeting with management.
- Initial responses were received within 10 working days of the draft report being issued.
- Final reports were issued within 1 working day of final management responses being received.

APPENDIX I - DEFINITIONS

LEVEL OF ASSURANCE	DESIGN of internal control framework		OPERATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS of internal controls	
	Findings from review	Design Opinion	Findings from review	Effectiveness Opinion
Substantial 	Appropriate procedures and controls in place to mitigate the key risks.	There is a sound system of internal control designed to achieve system objectives.	No, or only minor, exceptions found in testing of the procedures and controls.	The controls that are in place are being consistently applied.
Moderate 	In the main there are appropriate procedures and controls in place to mitigate the key risks reviewed albeit with some that are not fully effective.	Generally a sound system of internal control designed to achieve system objectives with some exceptions.	A small number of exceptions found in testing of the procedures and controls.	Evidence of non compliance with some controls, that may put some of the system objectives at risk.
Limited 	A number of significant gaps identified in the procedures and controls in key areas. Where practical, efforts should be made to address in-year.	System of internal controls is weakened with system objectives at risk of not being achieved.	A number of reoccurring exceptions found in testing of the procedures and controls. Where practical, efforts should be made to address in-year.	Non-compliance with key procedures and controls places the system objectives at risk.
No 	For all risk areas there are significant gaps in the procedures and controls. Failure to address in-year affects the quality of the organisation's overall internal control framework.	Poor system of internal control.	Due to absence of effective controls and procedures, no reliance can be placed on their operation. Failure to address in-year affects the quality of the organisation's overall internal control framework.	Non compliance and/or compliance with inadequate controls.

Recommendation Significance	
High 	A weakness where there is substantial risk of loss, fraud, impropriety, poor value for money, or failure to achieve organisational objectives. Such risk could lead to an adverse impact on the business. Remedial action must be taken urgently.
Medium 	A weakness in control which, although not fundamental, relates to shortcomings which expose individual business systems to a less immediate level of threatening risk or poor value for money. Such a risk could impact on operational objectives and should be of concern to senior management and requires prompt specific action.
Low 	Areas that individually have no significant impact, but where management would benefit from improved controls and/or have the opportunity to achieve greater effectiveness and/or efficiency.



BDO LLP, a UK limited liability partnership registered in England and Wales under number OC305127, is a member of BDO International Limited, a UK company limited by guarantee, and forms part of the international BDO network of independent member firms. A list of members' names is open to inspection at our registered office, 55 Baker Street, London W1U 7EU. BDO LLP is authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority to conduct investment business.

BDO is the brand name of the BDO network and for each of the BDO Member Firms.

BDO Northern Ireland, a partnership formed in and under the laws of Northern Ireland, is licensed to operate within the international BDO network of independent member firms.

Copyright ©2016 BDO LLP. All rights reserved.

www.bdo.co.uk

