

Board of Management

Meeting of the Performance Remuneration and Nominations Committee

MINUTE OF 2nd MEETING HELD ON 23 JANUARY 2016 AT 1700 HRS (PRNC2) AT CITY CAMPUS

| | |
|--|----------------------------------|
| Present | |
| Alisdair Barron (AB) | Paul Little (PL) |
| George Black (GB) | Colin McMurray (CM) |
| Jim Gallacher (JG) | Lesley Woolfries (LW) (Convener) |
| Karen Kelly (KK) | |
| In attendance | |
| Paul Clark (PC) (College Secretary/Minute) | |
| Apologies for absence | |
| None | |

| | | |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------|
| Item PRNC2-1 | Apologies for Absence | |
| Paper No: | Lead: Convener | Action requested: Note |
| Decision/Noted | There were no apologies received. | |

| | | |
|-----------------------|--|------------------------|
| Item PRNC2-2 | Declarations of Interest | |
| Paper No: | Lead: Convener | Action requested: Note |
| Decision/Noted | The Principal declared his interest in paper PRNC2-C re Principal's Performance and Remuneration Review. It was agreed to discuss any matters relating to the Principal's remuneration at the end of the agenda after the Principal had withdrawn. | |

| | | |
|--|---|---------------------------|
| Item PRNC2-3 | Minute of the PRNC meeting held on 24 October 2016 | |
| Paper No: PRNC1-A | Lead: Convener | Action requested: Approve |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | Amendments: none | |
| | Matters Arising: none | |
| | Actions: All complete | |
| Decision/Noted | Noted | |

| Item PRNC2-4 | | Committee Terms of Reference | |
|--------------------------------|---|------------------------------|--|
| Paper No: PRNC1-B | Lead: P Clark | Action requested: Approve | |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | <p>The revision and proposed changes to the Committee ToRs were discussed, the Committee noting the alignment with the recommendations from the CDN Remuneration Committee member training.</p> <p>It was agreed that the ToRs should also make reference to the expectation that the PRNC would review performance and related evidence and guidance, and make recommendations to the Board of management regarding the remuneration of the Principal and senior staff.</p> <p>All other changes agreed.</p> | | |
| Decision/Noted | Approved | | |

| Item PRNC2-5 | | Principal's Performance and Remuneration Review | |
|--------------------------------|---|---|--|
| Paper No: PRNC1-C | Lead: Board Chair A Barron | Action requested: Discussion/decision | |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | <p>It was noted that the Principal would withdraw from any discussion regarding the Principal's Remuneration.</p> <p>AB reported that the Principal's performance review has been completed. This was undertaken within a framework, which was agreed in full consultation with staff and student members, who were also invited to provide supporting evidence. This has been included in the evidence gathered by the Board Chair from a wide range of sources. Members were invited to peruse the evidence at any time.</p> <p>The Committee noted the range of sources consulted in the development of the Principal's performance framework and supporting evidence relating to the Principal's performance. It was also acknowledged that stakeholder evidence included external reviews, staff and student surveys. The Committee agreed that this was an appropriate approach.</p> <p>The Committee noted that the review process had been undertaken satisfactorily.</p> <p>In response to one member's query, the Chair and Principal provided an outline of the College's processes for remuneration review, pay and terms and conditions settlement, and job evaluation processes for College staff. PL provided an historical and political perspective on the move towards the harmonisation of terms and conditions of teaching staff.</p> <p>It was noted that the involvement of the Vice Chair (VC) was that of oversight, and to agree the appropriateness of the conduct and findings of the review. Given the VC's role as the Senior Independent Member of the Board, the College Secretary advised that the VC would not be directly involved in the Principal's performance evaluation, to enable appropriately independent intervention in the event of disagreement or findings that were deemed unbalanced or otherwise contentious. It was agreed that the process should explicitly reflect this role.</p> | | |

| | |
|-----------------------|--|
| | <p>Action PC – to revise process, and include in the introduction to the Performance Review template.</p> <p>It was agreed to defer consideration of Principal's remuneration to later in the meeting.</p> |
| Decision/Noted | Performance Review progress noted. |

| | | |
|--|---|---------------------------------------|
| Item PRNC2-6 | National Bargaining Update | |
| Paper No: | Lead: Principal P Little | Action requested: Discussion/Decision |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | <p>PL reported that negotiations with teaching staff (EIS) and support staff (Unison) had been taking place separately. A settlement has been reached with Unison, and negotiations with EIS are ongoing.</p> <p>PL indicated that salary banding and terms and conditions agreement (Workforce of the Future) was to occur simultaneously. It was also noted that CoGC remained committed to finding an agreed settlement to which it was bound. There is still no agreement on teaching hours taught per week, with EIS seeking 21 teaching hours, and management requiring 24hrs per week. PL maintained that 21hrs/pw was financially unsustainable. A further area of disagreement was reported with regard to holiday entitlement.</p> <p>PL outlined the approach taken with progressing negotiations via various working groups, and the responsibility to communicate with the Employer's Association, noting greater progress in some areas than others.</p> <p>AB highlighted the differential between the position of the trade unions and the demand from students for new modes and approaches to learning.</p> <p>LW noted that the pay offer agreed with Unison exceeded the Public Sector Pay Policy. It was also noted that the additional costs associated with applying the likely transition arrangements with EIS must be offset by agreeing more efficient and sustainable terms and conditions.</p> | |
| Decision/Noted | Noted | |

| | | |
|--|--|---------------------------------------|
| Item PRNC2-7 | Board Member Long Service Recognition | |
| Paper No: PRNC1-E | Lead: Board Chair A Barron | Action requested: Discussion/Decision |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | <p>AB introduced the proposal, noting that Board members make a significant contribution to the College and the sector, without cost.</p> <p>The Committee agreed the recommendations to recognise Board member service, noting that this was in line with similar recognition for College staff, and welcomed the transparency of the proposal.</p> | |
| Decision/Noted | <p>Recommended for approval by the Board</p> <p>Action: PC</p> | |

| | | |
|--------------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|
| Item PRNC2-8 | Principal's Update | |
| Paper No: PRNC1-F | Lead: Principal P Little | Action requested: Discussion/Decision |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | <p>LW noted the Principal's nomination as FE Leader of the Year.</p> <p>PL referred to the publicity published in the Herald over Christmas with regard to relations between CoGC and GCRB, and reassured the Committee that he, and the College as a whole, continues to maintain a good relationship with the GCRB Chair. It was noted that this publicity was in the context of a number of negative press stories relating to education sectors and most recently the Funding Council. PL also referred to the EIS vote of no confidence in PLs role as a negotiator, which was described as tactical on the part of EIS.</p> <p>PL reported that the Finance Ministers for NI, Wales, and Scotland had met at the Riverside Campus. This represented a significant event for CoGC, further enhancing the College's reputation.</p> | |
| Decision/Noted | Noted | |

| | | |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------------|
| Item PRNC2-9 | College Final PIs for 2015-16 | |
| Paper No: | Lead: | Action requested: Note |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | The Committee noted the paper. | |
| Decision/Noted | Noted | |

| | | |
|--------------------------------|---|------------------------|
| Item PRNC2-10 | Performance Review – Faculties Round 1 | |
| Paper No: | Lead: Convener | Action requested: Note |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | <p>JG noted that some PIs were RAG rated RED, and requested some comment from the Principal.</p> <p>KK also highlighted that the paper noted that targets had been readjusted as they had been deemed “particularly ambitious”, and sought clarity.</p> <p>PL reported that there is now a new VP (SE) and a new Performance Director. PL reported that areas for improvement had been identified, that improvements were actively being pursued, as was the enhancement of accountability with respect to target achievement.</p> <p>It was noted that the paper had not included an account of improvement actions. PL agreed that the paper might have been more fulsome in that respect. The Committee agreed that further detail would be welcomed with regard to improvement strategies.</p> <p>Agreed that J McGillivray and D Dickson attend the next meeting – DD to present an enhanced paper with reference to specific areas where improvements have been put in place, including any action plans. (JMcG to be in attendance).</p> | |

| | |
|----------------|--|
| Decision/Noted | PC to request a more detailed paper as described, and request JMcG attendance at the next meeting. |
| | Action: PC |

| | |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Item PRNC2-11 | Strategic Risk Review |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | The Committee noted the paper. |
| Decision/Noted | Noted |

| | |
|--------------------------------|--|
| Item PRNC2-12 | AONB |
| Discussion/ Matters Arising | <p><u>Strategic Workshop</u></p> <p>LW reported that there will be a strategic workshop meeting tomorrow with GCRB, with the newly formed Strategic Working Group.</p> <p>PL reported that in discussions with GCRB there is currently no appeals procedure, which has been discussed with the Executive Director of GCRB. PL further reported that Clyde College have recently committed to a £10m capital expenditure, and that Kelvin had received £3m lottery funding, of which CoGC was unaware until last week. The Committee noted that this constituted further significant contextual information for the GCRB decision not to award any capital grant funding to CoGC for 2016-17.</p> <p>PL welcomed the involvement of George Black in the strategic workshop with GCRB.</p> <p>AB provided background to the recent decision-making processes at GCRB, noting that CoGC continues to carry the principal burden of cost-savings.</p> <p><u>Principal's Remuneration</u></p> <p>It was agreed that a full discussion of the Principal's remuneration be considered at a special meeting of the PRNC. LW acknowledged that there are many consequences of such a decision that should be considered, as well as existing pay policy and guidance to which the PRNC is obliged to refer.</p> |
| Decision/Noted | <p>Agreed to meet prior to BoM Planning Day. Develop paper with guidance & recommendations, and circulate with proposed dates for a meeting.</p> <p>Action: LW, AB, PC</p> |

| | |
|----------------------|--|
| Item PRNC2-13 | Date of next Meeting |
| Decision/Noted | The next scheduled meeting is on Monday 8 May. |

Convener's Signature _____

Date _____

ANNEX TO THE MINUTE

ACTION POINTS ARISING FROM THE MEETING

| Item | Description | Owner | Target Date |
|----------|---|----------------|----------------------|
| PRNC2-4 | Committee Terms of Reference: Submit recommended revised ToR at next meeting of the BoM. | PC | 19 04 17 |
| PRNC2-7 | Board Member Long Service Recognition: Recommend for approval by the Board. | PC | 19 04 17 |
| PRNC2-10 | Performance Review – Faculties Round 1: Present enhanced paper including action plans at next meeting. | PC/DD/ JMcG | 08 05 17 |
| PRNC2-12 | AONB: Principal’s Remuneration: Consider at a special meeting prior to BoM Planning Day. | PC/ALL | Prior to 23 02 17 |

ACTION POINTS ARISING FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

| Item | Description | Owner | Target Date |
|----------|--|------------------|---|
| PRNC5-4 | Strategic Risk Review: PC to update Risk 14. | PC | ASAP Complete |
| PRNC4-4 | Executive Salary Review: Item deferred. | PL/PC | 09 05 16 Complete |
| PRNC4-6 | Education Scotland Review: Invite Education Scotland to next meeting of the Board. | PL/PC | 06 04 16 Complete |
| PRNC4-12 | SFC Guidance for Severance Schemes and Settlement Agreements: Check approval status of College’s existing severance scheme and ensure College is compliant with flow chart. | PC/ST | ASAP |
| PRNC4-13 | AONB: DM to attend next meeting of the GCRB in the absence of AB. | DM | 25 04 16 Complete |
| PRNC3-B | PC to finalise interview panel | PC | ASAP Complete |
| PRNC3-5 | Revised ToRs to Board for approval | PC | 06 04 16 Complete |
| PRNC3-6 | Paper to be presented to PRNC re proposed Executive Salary levels | PL | 14 03 16 Complete |
| PRNC3-7 | Confirm interview panel availability, and arrangements | PC | ASAP Complete |
| PRNC1-9 | Director Salary Bands and Increments: Provide proposal paper for the next meeting. | PL | 18 01 16 Carried fwd to 14 03 16 Complete |
| PRNC2-14 | Complaints Report: Investigate benchmarking figures against other Colleges. | AC/GMcV | Ongoing Closed |
| PRNC4-14 | AOCB, Convener Training and Induction: Conveners to undertake training and induction as provided by College’s Scotland as appropriate. | Conveners/ PL | Ongoing Complete |
| PRNC4-05 | Director Salary Bands and Increments: Revisit and revise paper as agreed. | JK/ST | Ongoing Superseded PRNC1-9 |
| PRNC4-06 | Senior Staff Remuneration: Initiate 3 stage process as agreed. | DB | Ongoing Complete |